

Wednesday 16 November and Thursday 17 November 2011, Charlemagne Building, Brussels

European Commission  
Charlemagne Building  
Rue de la Loi 170  
B-1000 Brussels

## List of Participants and Speakers (and their associations and conflict of interests)

Willem Penning, European Commission DG SANCO

**Mats-Olof Mattsson**, Austrian Institute of Technology, Seibersdorf

see statements

Michèle Rivasi, MEP Greens

**Phil Chadwick**, MCL Technology Ltd.

ICNIRP: Consulting Expert (<http://www.icnirp.net/cm.htm>)

Chris Portier, US Center for Disease Control

see statements

**Georg Neubauer**, Austrian Institute of Technology GmbH

FSM funded researcher

[http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)

also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))

**Simon Mann**, UK Health Protection Agency

ICNIRP: Standing Committee on Physics & Engineering

<http://www.icnirp.net/sc3.htm>

**Joachim Schüz**, International Agency for Research on Cancer

FSM funded researcher

[http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)

also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))

**Carmela Marino**, Italian National Agency for New Technologies, Energy and Sustainable Economic Development, Italy

ICNIRP: Consulting Expert (<http://www.icnirp.net/cm.htm>)

**Emilie Van Deventer**, World Health Organization

MTHR UK <http://www.mthr.org.uk/members/members.htm>

MTHR: «Funding is being provided jointly by the (UK) government and the mobile phone industry through an established firewall arrangement to ensure the independence of research»

FSM funded researcher [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)

also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))

Clemens Dasenbrock, Fraunhofer Institute for Toxicology and Experimental Medicine, Germany

**Isabelle Lagroye**, University of Bordeaux, France

FSM funded researcher

[http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)

also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))

ICNIRP: Standing Committee on Biology

<http://www.icnirp.net/sc2.htm>

Kerstin Hug, Swiss Tropical Institute, Basel

**Leeka Kheifets**, University of California, Los Angeles, USA

FSM funded researcher

[http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)

also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))

ICNIRP: Standing Committee on Epidemiology

- Leeka Kheifets**, Cont. see statements  
<http://www.icnirp.net/sc1.htm>  
 Leeka Kheifets formerly worked at EPRI, the research arm of the electric utility industry, in Palo Alto, CA, and she still receives research support from EPRI. (MWN, November 2006)
- Jukka Juutilainen**, University of Kuopio, Finland  
**ICNIRP: Standing Committee on Biology**  
<http://www.icnirp.net/sc2.htm>
- Peter Achermann**, University of Zürich, Switzerland  
 Member of **IT'IS Foundation Board (Vice President)**  
<http://www.itis.ethz.ch/who-we-are/foundation-board/executive-board/>  
**FSM funded researcher** [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)  
 also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))
- James Rubin** see statements
- Anssi Auvinen**, Radiation and Nuclear Safety Authority  
<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/bem.20716/abstract> (Author Information – Conflict of Interest):  
 Anssi Auvinen receives research funding for the Finnish COSMOS component from the research programme of the National Technology Agency with contributions from network operators (TeliaSonera and Elisa) and Nokia. AA was the PI of the Finnish component of the Interphone consortium that was funded through the Fifth EU Framework programme, with partial funding from the Mobile Manufacturers Forum and the GSM Association (with UICC as the firewall)
- Maria Rosaria Scarfi**, CNR-Institute for Electromagnetic Sensing of Environment, Italy  
**ICNIRP: Consulting Expert** (<http://www.icnirp.net/cm.htm>)
- Zenon Sienkiewicz**, UK Health Protection Agency  
**ICNIRP: Main Commission Standing Committee on Biology:** <http://www.icnirp.net/sc2.htm>  
**MTHR UK** <http://www.mthr.org.uk/members/members.htm>
- Elisabeth Cardis, CREAL, Spain
- Christoffer Johansen**, Danish Cancer Society see statements  
 Heikki Hämalainen, University of Turku, Finland  
 Jorgen Bach Andersen, Aalborg University, Denmark
- Norbert Leitgeb**, Graz University of Technology, Austria  
**ICNIRP: Consulting Expert** (<http://www.icnirp.net/cm.htm>)
- Paolo Ravazzani, CNR Milan, Italy
- Maria Feychting**, Karolinska Institutet, Sweden,  
**ICNIRP: Main Commission Standing Committee on Biology:** <http://www.icnirp.net/sc2.htm>  
**FSM funded researcher** [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)  
 also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))
- Niels Kuster**, IT'IS, Switzerland  
**IT'IS Executive Board (Director)** <http://www.itis.ethz.ch/who-we-are/foundation-board/executive-board/>  
**IT'IS Funding:** <http://www.itis.ethz.ch/who-we-are/funding/>  
**FSM funded researcher** [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)  
 also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))  
 Note: The WHO was aware of Niels Kuster's connections to the phone industry and therefore was invited to participate in the May 2011 IARC meeting only as a "specialist" with no voting rights
- William Dab, CNAM, Paris France,  
**Peter Wiedemann**, Institut für Technologie Karlsruhe, Germany see statements

Martin Seychell, Deputy Director General, DG SANCO

### Session 1:

#### Introduction, Horizontal topics, General outline

Chair: Peter Achermann, University of Zürich, Switzerland; Theodoros Samaras, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Greece

**Peter Achermann**, University of Zürich, Switzerland

Member of **IT'IS Foundation Board (Vice President)**

<http://www.itis.ethz.ch/who-we-are/foundation-board/executive-board/>

**FSM funded researcher** [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)

also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))

### Session 2:

#### The main sources of uncertainty in EMF health research and how they are addressed?

Chair: Simon Mann, UK Health Protection Agency Rapporteur; Rüdiger Matthes, German Federal Office for Radiation Protection

**Simon Mann**: **ICNIRP: Standing Committee on Physics & Engineering**

<http://www.icnirp.net/sc3.htm>

**Rüdiger Matthes**: **ICNIRP: Main Commission, Vice-Chairperson**

<http://www.icnirp.net/commission.htm>

### Session 3:

#### Current state of knowledge – Where are the areas of scientific consensus (consistency, coherence)

Chair: Emilie Van Deventer, WHO Rapporteur; Martin Rössli, University of Basel, Switzerland

**Emilie Van Deventer**

**MTHR UK** <http://www.mthr.org.uk/members/members.htm>

MTHR: «Funding is being provided jointly by the (UK) government and the mobile phone industry through an established firewall arrangement to ensure the independence of research»

**FSM funded researcher** [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)

also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))

**Martin Rössli**

see statements

**FSM funded researcher** [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/personen_e.htm)

also see [http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring\\_e.htm](http://www.mobile-research.ethz.ch/english/sponsoring_e.htm))

### Session 4:

#### What are the areas of scientific inconsistency and knowledge gaps?

Chair: Anssi Auvinen, Radiation and Nuclear Safety Authority, Finland Rapporteur; Hannu Norppa, Finnish Institute of Occupational Health

**Anssi Auvinen**

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/bem.20716/abstract> (Author Information – Conflict of Interest):

Anssi Auvinen receives research funding for the Finnish COSMOS component from the research programme of the National Technology Agency with contributions from network operators (TeliaSonera and Elisa) and Nokia. AA was the PI of the Finnish component of the Interphone consortium that was funded through the Fifth EU Framework programme, with partial funding from the Mobile Manufacturers Forum and the GSM Association (with UICC as the firewall)

### Session 5:

#### Lessons learned and recommendations for the future

Chair and moderator: Paolo Ravazzani, CNR Milan, Italy, Rapporteur: Mats-Olof Mattsson, Austrian Institute of Technology, Seibersdorf

#### Conference Scientific Steering Group

Chair: Paolo Ravazzani

SCENIHR members: Mats-Olof Mattsson, Joachim Schüz, Anssi Auvinen, Hannu Norppa

Other members: Emilie Van Deventer, Isabelle Lagroye, Chris Portier, Peter Achermann, Simon Mann

## 2011 International Scientific Conference on EMF and Health

Wednesday 16 November and Thursday 17 November 2011, Charlemagne Building, Brussels

Hereafter, **a collection of statements** that have been made in the past by participants in the above conference.

### CHRIS PORTIER

... «He (*Repacholi*) misrepresented the conclusions of the expert panel he assembled to complete the WHO's Environmental Health Criteria on power-frequency EMF health risks, as pointed out by NIEHS Associate Director **Chris Portier; Up to half, if not more, of the WHO's EMF project's funding came from industry.**»

MWN XXVI, No. 9, November 17, 2006

... «In the summer of 2001, an IARC panel unanimously classified EMFs as a possible human carcinogen, ... **One of those who argued for the stronger classification was Chris Portier of the US NIEHS.**»

MWN, December 2004

... «Portier, who runs NIEHS' Environmental Toxicology Program, had pushed to upgrade the EMF threat at IARC to "probable" carcinogen **but then forgot all about it back at home. It's as if Portier were playing some kind of intellectual parlor game** —"Let me see if I can out-argue those who say EMFs are harmless"— but he seems to feel no moral responsibility to use his position of authority at NIEHS to protect the children.»

MWN, December 2004

... «The net result is that the WHO and NIEHS continue to endorse the current international exposure standards that do nothing to protect against a cancer risk. Repacholi, Kheifets and **Portier are in effect telling mothers and fathers that their children could be safely exposed up to 1,000 mG all day, every day.** By any measure, an irresponsible recommendation for those charged with protecting public health.»

MWN Vol XXIV, No. 1, December 2004

### LEEKA KHEIFETS

... «The net result is that the WHO and NIEHS continue to endorse the current international exposure standards that do nothing to protect against a cancer risk. Repacholi, **Kheifets and Portier are in effect telling mothers and fathers that their children could be safely exposed up to 1,000 mG all day, every day.** By any measure, an irresponsible recommendation for those charged with protecting public health.»

MWN Vol XXIV, No. 1, December 2004

### JAMES RUBIN

... «A recent review of 30 studies into electrical sensitivity by Dr James Rubin at the King's College London School of Medicine **found no evidence that electrical fields cause ill health.**

**This study** and one being carried out at the University of Essex into whether attention span and memory are affected by exposure to a mobile phone mast have **received £750,000 from the Government and telecommunications industry.**» ...

The Telegraph, November 8, 2005

... «Doubts about Electrosensitivity. James Rubin of Kings College London: «There is no robust evidence that there is a direct link [between reported symptoms and EMFs], and there is reasonably robust evidence that there is no link.» **Rubin believes that the symptoms are real, but the causes are psychological rather than physiological.** Rubin was a speaker at last September's conference (*London, September 8 & 9, 2008*), "EMF & Health – A Global Issue - Exploring Appropriate Precautionary Approaches". See also his paper: "Electrosensitivity: A Case for Caution with Precaution."»

MWN, April 25, 2009

**MATS-OLOF MATTSSON**

... «Mild and Hardell, joined by Drs. Michael Kundi of the University of Vienna and **Mats-Olof Mattson** (now at the Austrian Institute of Technology in Seibersdorf), who like Hardell is at Örebro University, **will offer a detailed critique of the SSI** (= Swedish Radiation Protection Authority) report. (\*) "Mobile Telephones and Cancer: Is There Really No Evidence of an Association?" will appear in the International Journal of Molecular Medicine. The SSI report at the center of the controversy was written by Drs. John Boyce Jr. and Joseph McLaughlin of the International Epidemiology Institute in Rockville, MD.»

MWN, Vol XXIII, No. 2, March/April 2003

**MATS-OLOF MATTSSON, Cont.**

(\*) *These two epidemiologists were co-authors of the Danish cohort study by Johansen et al, which is among the reviewed studies. The Danish Cancer Fund, two Danish mobile phone net operators and IEI financed this study ...*

**CHRISTOFFER JOHANSEN**

... «Late last year (2006), Schüz and **Johansen** updated their analysis of a Danish cohort and **concluded that it provides "evidence that any large association of risk of cancer and cellular telephone use can be excluded."**

MWN, Vol. XXVII, No. 5, April 2007

... «Schüz said that his outlook on long-term risk is largely based, not on Interphone, but on his and Johansen's Danish cohort studies and especially on their more recent analysis of the incidence of brain tumors in the Nordic countries, published late last year. **Neither points to an increase in brain tumors among the general population.**»

MWN, June 9, 2010

**PETER WIEDEMANN**

... «In the EMF field, Germany's Peter Wiedemann leads the charge with the **financial support of T-Mobile**. Using the results of his surveys on people's perceptions of mobile-phone health risks, he tries to convince policy makers that **the precautionary principle can do more harm than good**. Here's the nub of his argument as expressed in a letter to EMBO Reports, a European journal: "Subjects who received information about precautionary measures [for RF radiation from mobile phones] expressed a higher perception of risk than subjects who did not receive the information." Wiedemann calls this finding "counter-intuitive." We disagree. It's a logical reaction to information that the phones may be more dangerous than people previously thought.

In one of his papers (*Journal of Risk Research, Vol. 9, Issue 4, 2006, DOI 10.1080/1366987060080211: "The Impacts of Precautionary Measures and the Disclosure of Scientific Uncertainty on EMF Risk Perception and Trust"*), Wiedemann observed, **"Our study indicates that people feel more threatened by the so-called 'electrosmog' when precautionary measures mention the need for increased protection of sensitive locations."** While he was writing about RF radiation from cell phone towers near day-care centers, schools and hospitals, it's easy to see how the ENA, the Australian trade association, found a way to argue that ARPANSA should drop requirements for warning signs from its new standard. Wood and ARPANSA seem to have had no problem accepting this line of **phony reasoning.**»

... «as the cell phone controversy took off, a convenient school of thinking emerged, led by Peter Wiedemann, a German researcher with ties to the mobile phone industry. It argues that **warnings about RF health risks do more harm than good because people can get scared.**» ...

MWN, June 11, 2009

**MARTIN RÖÖSLI**

... «"The pattern of results looks to me as though **there isn't a causal relationship in term of increased risk with long-term use,**" Martin RööslI told Microwave News. RööslI, of the Swiss Tropical and Public Health Institute at the University of Basel, ran the Swiss component of CEFALO.» ...

MWN, July 27 & 28, 2011

**CEFALO**

Lloyd L. Morgan: "Scientists manipulated research on brain tumour risk for children"

[www.emfacts.com](http://www.emfacts.com): October 2, 2011

Mona Nilsson: "Swedish article on inadequacies with the CEFALO study (Children and mobile phone use)"

[www.emfacts.com](http://www.emfacts.com): November 3, 2011

MWN, October 25, 2011, „Short Takes“ on the study:

**“Systematic review of wireless phone use and brain cancer and other head tumors”**

Michael H. Repacholi, Alexander Lerchl, **Martin Röösli**, Zenon Sienkiewicz, Anssi Auvinen, Jürgen Breckenkamp, Guglielmo d'Inzeo, Paul Elliott, Patrizia Frei, Sabine Heinrich, Isabelle Lagroye, Anna Lahkola, David L. McCormick, Silke Thomas, Paolo Vecchia

Last year, sensing that the upcoming IARC assessment might undercut his legacy at both the WHO and ICNIRP, Mike Repacholi assembled a team to prepare its own assessment of the possible tumor risks from RF radiation: That review has just been released by the journal Bioelectromagnetics.

No surprise: In contrast to the IARC decision to classify RF radiation as a possible human cancer agent, Repacholi and his 14 coauthors could not identify any hazard beyond overheating. What is surprising is that no one from the WHO EMF project and only one member of ICNIRP, Paolo Vecchia, joined his study team. On the other hand, two who served on the IARC panel did sign up: David McCormick of the U.S. and Martin Röösli of Switzerland. Repacholi's second author is Alex Lerchl, who has long sought to discredit studies showing that RF can lead to DNA breaks. Here again no surprise: **the paper finds that "studies do not support the conclusion that RF exposure causes genotoxic effects."**

As we long ago documented, Repacholi's EMF project at WHO received substantial support from the cell phone industry. Did the industry subsidize this new review? The published paper provides no information on possible conflicts. We have asked for clarification from Repacholi and Jim Lin, the editor of Bioelectromagnetics.

Paul Elliott and Anssi Auvinen disclosed their conflicts of interest. **All other authors reported no conflicts of interest.** (5 authors are members of ICNIRP, 1 author member of ICNIRP and MTHR, 2 authors are funded researchers of FSM, 1 author is a member of the German Office of Radiation Protection as well as professor at the private Jacobs University in Bremen which is in close relationship with the Vodafone Foundation)